

Fish Ecology Discussion		Student:	Score:	
	Exceptional	Good	Poor	
Speaking & presenting skills	Spoke loud and clear, did not interrupt students, gave people time to answer questions, finished topics/questions before moving on, drew good figures or tables 10...9	Speaking a little hesitant, too quick to provide answer or changed topic to quickly, figures or tables not presented well 8...7	Spoke too quietly, did not control the discussion and let it get disorganized, interrupted students, relied on professor too much, did not draw figures or tables 6...5...4...3...2...1...0	/10
Summary	Good concise summary (<10 min), included major aspects of study relevant to discussion without too much detail – hit only highlights 15...14...13	Summary a little long (10-20 min), included a few unnecessary details, too many methods, or missed one or two highlights 12...11...10...9	Summary incomplete or labored the details, summary > 20 min 8...7...6...5...4...3...2...1...0	/15
Critique	Highlighted good and bad aspects of the study, explained why they were good or bad (or encouraged discussion from students), offered suggestions on how to improve study design 15...14...13	Highlighted good and bad aspects of the study, may have missed some points, may have focused on negatives, usually led to discussion of why good or bad 12...11...10...9	Missed many good or bad things in study, a lot more focus on bad than on good, frequently there were no resolutions about problems in study, did not involve students in critique 8...7...6...5...4...3...2...1...0	/15
Leading discussion	Effectively asked questions, discussion technique encouraged answers from students, was able to give good answers to student questions, brought in several examples from other papers 10...9	Sometimes answered their own questions so that other students were not encouraged or motivated to participate, did not always answer student questions, only one or two other papers brought into discussion 8...7	Other students not encouraged or motivated to participate, did not answer student questions, did not bring other papers in to discussion 6...5...4...3...2...1...0	/10